

Draft Minutes
Joint Advisory Committee for the Improvement of Air Quality
in the CD Juarez, Chihuahua / El Paso, Texas / Doña Ana County, New Mexico
Air Quality Management Basin
El Paso, Texas
November 12, 1996

Environmental Protection Agency - Regional Administrator Jane Saginaw began the first meeting of the Joint Advisory Committee (JAC) for the Improvement of Air Quality in the Paso del Norte Air Quality Management Basin with a statement regarding the solutions participants on the panel have been working on for some time to improve air quality. The mechanism is now in place to officially hear those recommendations.

Ms. Saginaw introduced US participants on the JAC.

Mr. George Avalos - Director of Transportation for Doña Ana County, NM;

Dr. Elaine Barron - an El Paso physician, member of the Texas Water Development Board, and former Chairman of the Paso del Norte Air Quality Task Force (PDNAQTF);

Mr. Archie Clouse - Air Program Director for the Texas Natural Resource Conservation Commission - TNRCC Region 6;

Mr. John Cordova - Engineer for the City of El Paso, Texas;

Dr. Carlos Rincon - Border Air Program Director for the Environmental Defense Fund (EDF);

Mr. Tom Martin - Environmental Manager for ASARCO;

Dr. Charles Groat - Director for the Center for Environmental Resource Management (CERM) at the University of Texas at El Paso (UTEP);

Mr. Danny Vickers - President of EDM International and Chairman of the PDNAQTF;

Ms. Cecilia Williams - Chief of the Air Quality Bureau of the New Mexico Environmental Department (NMED);

Ms. Jane Saginaw - Regional Administrator for EPA - Dallas.

Dr. Victor Hugo Paramo introduced the Mexican participants on the JAC. He prefaced the introduction with a statement indicating that Mexico was pleased to participate in the first work session of the JAC, and all the members are ready to begin working and actively participate.

Mexican participants on the JAC are as follows:

Biol. Maria del Pilar Lopez Marco- Delegada Federal for the Procuraduria Federal de Proteccion al Ambiente (PROFEPA) represented by Quim. Maria del Pilar Leal;

Dr. Rosalba Rojas Martinez - Director for Center for Environmental Health Programs with the Secretaria de Salud;

Ing. Jose Treviño Fernandez - Environmental Department Director for the State of Chihuahua represented by Biol. Gerardo Tarin;

Ing. Oscar Ibañez Hernandez - Director of the Department of Urban Development and Ecology

Draft Minutes: November 12, 1996

Joint Advisory Committee on Air Quality Improvement

Paso del Norte Air Quality Management Basin

JAC-1196.wpd

for CD Juarez, Chihuahua;

Dr. Enrique Suarez - Executive Director for the Mexican Federation of Public Health Associations (FEMAP);

Dr. Hector A Quevedo - Universidad Autonoma de CD Juarez;

Ing. Rene Franco - Representing Environmental Organizations in CD Juarez;

Mr. Angel Peralta Miram - Representing the Business Community;

M. en C. Felipe Adrian Vasquez - Representing the Chihuahua Consultative Committee for Sustainable Development;

Dr. Victor Hugo Paramo - Representing the National Institute of Ecology (INE) for the Secretariat of the Environment, Natural Resources and Fisheries (SEMARNAP).

Each member of the JAC was offered an opportunity to make a statement of the resources they bring to the table:

Carlos Rincon: Recalled the PDNAQTF symposium held June 26 and 27, 1996 in the CD Juarez and work sessions conducted with regarding the AQMB and JAC. Dr. Rincon presented to Ms. Saginaw and Dr. Paramo a document/notebook in both Spanish and English containing presentations by various speakers at the symposium. He congratulated all participants to the first JAC meeting for working together to make a difference in air quality in the Paso del Norte Region. He offered copies of the Symposium document to others in the JAC.

Adrian Vasquez: Offered to work on the JAC within the framework of sustainable development and the work currently taking place in Mexico to promote the concept of sustainable development. His interest is in supporting the different levels of government regarding implementation of issues dealing w/ these concepts. Work with the JAC will continue in that area to develop Mexico's Border XXI program which consists in the implementation of agreements regarding sustainable development in which Mexico is involved.

Dr. Charles Groat: Referred to two key items Ms. Saginaw discussed in the introduction including the need for short term practical solutions to a very real and visible problem, and the public as it watches the JAC function will be looking to us not so much for the advise we give to the La Paz Workgroup or pronouncements that are made, but the effects of the committee on the air quality problems we face in the EP/Juarez region. He hopes that the committee comes to grips with issues of prioritizing the problems and creating strategies to deal with them. Representing UTEP and universities in general, he looks forward to the support from regional universities in the activities of the JAC by the expertise they will provide both in the short term and long term in solving the air pollution problem.

Quim. Ma. del Pilar Leal: Offered some observations on the agenda. One of the more important issues regarding the agenda is to provide ample notice to all members of the JAC so they can

plan to attend meetings. There is a common interest for PROFEPA and all person and institutions participating in the JAC to provide recommendations to improve air quality. To achieve this it is important to develop a work plan and define short, medium and long term goals that can be integrated, analyzed and presented. We're at a moment in time to develop a good work plan to have in place early next year with agreements on both sides of the border to move forward. The group should provide serious alternatives for the JAC to be effective. Its not a matter of talking about rules and regulations, but looking forward to projects and goals that can be realized.

Archie Clouse: (Began with a humorous anecdote) Many times in the past we simply invite high level federal officials to El Paso and air pollution quickly clears. Given the absence of air pollution today we either invited the wrong ones or the rule no longer holds true. Through his work in the Texas Air Control Board and as Air Program Manager with the TNRCC-Region 6 he has been involved in many binational programs. His commitment will be to continue working toward the goal of reducing air pollution through the JAC and through the work of the PDNAQTF. He is honored to be a member of the JAC and looks forward to working w/ each member of the group and make significant recommendations. Much of the groundwork has been laid out by the task force and the environmental agencies on both sides of the border and our two countries. We now have a vehicle that can deliver the mail to the Air Workgroup under the Border XXI Program; the mail being recommendations put forth through this committee. Lets not let the citizens of our two sister cities down.

Elaine Barron: Dr. Barron has worked with the PDNAQTF since 1993 and wants to thank all who have participated these last three years. We need to take heed, tread lightly, be respectful to each other to accomplish the great task we have before us. She personally does not want any fiascos when we're representing a new type of innovation within two governments. Dr. Barron is dedicated to the health of the individuals of this community in which we live, of Juarez, and of New Mexico. What we pollute the air with will come back to us in diseases, increased health care costs and in less cognitively sound people. We now have programs that are going to continue in this vein. The contaminants in air and water mobilized by our winds and by thermal inversions cause health hazards to our population. Not only is it unsightly, but if you think of these pollutants in the brains cells, in the blood vessels and lungs of individuals we have to take to heart that this is a great task before us.

She would like to continue the efforts that we have accomplished in the areas of health and linking them to the programs we already have in effect. She would like to expeditiously put an operational group together to form a committee to do what we need to do as far as an operational agenda is concerned and keep the process open to the public for continued public input. The group does not need to spin its wheels trying to gather information already in existence and not duplicate work of other agencies or task forces. It needs to come out with a program that will serve the people of this community. It is a privilege to serve on this committee and has nothing

but respect for her counterparts from Mexico working toward the common goal.

Cecilia Williams: Over the years we have become concerned about the level of air pollution particularly in the Sunland Park area. NMED wants to work with all parties - federal, state and local government, industry, health care to improve air quality for the residents of New Mexico and this area.

Gerardo Tarin: The State of Chihuahua is very interested in participating on this committee and on issues regarding air quality. The attributes of the federation are available to work toward improving air quality in this region.

Danny Vickers: He is a business person active in air quality issues for the last 5 years. Mr. Vickers thanked both governments for today's meeting and for establishment of the JAC. When he became involved 5 years ago he saw many well intentioned people trying to fix the problem, but did not see an integrated, coordinated binational effort. He also saw people who had worked 20 years on the air quality problem who were making very little progress. It was clear to him after consulting with Dr. Peter Emerson at the Environmental Defense Fund that we needed a JAC. Its absolutely essential to the process of cleaning up the air in this community. It is not the solution, but it is part of the solution. Its going to require a public-private partnership. Its going to require everyone in the audience interested in the problem to help us fix it. Its going to require community outreach.

This committee is not the end-all, but his expectation is that the JAC is the leadership along with the PDNAQTF to identify the problems, put together the plans, and figure out how to get the problem solved. We're not here for ceremonial meetings; we're not here to feel good about the discussion. We're here to genuinely fix the problem. He has been known as the agitator in this and other groups, and if that role needs to be played in the positive sense - not in a negative sense - then so be it because that's why he's here. He not here to do anything but to clean up the air and that's his number one objective.

He personally thanked Jane Saginaw and Dr. Victor Hugo Paramo for the confidence they have placed in us on a local level; without their help we're not going to fix the problem. We're here to do our part as private citizens and as local government agencies. We genuinely extend our arm to Ms. Saginaw and Dr. Paramo. Mr. Vickers also asked those in the audience who are not members of the PDNAQTF to approach Victor Valenzuela to get their name on the mailing list to receive notice of upcoming meetings of the task force. He also presented the new chairman of the PDNAQTF, Dr. Octavio Chavez. There are many people in the audience who participate in the task force these past years who, if we had 20 more slots (on the JAC), they would certainly be sitting along side the members of the JAC. He introduced Biol. Francisco Nuñez from the Municipal Water Department for CD Juarez and Erin Ross from NMSU and many others.

Draft Minutes: November 12, 1996
Joint Advisory Committee on Air Quality Improvement
Paso del Norte Air Quality Management Basin
JAC-1196.wpd

Enrique Suarez: Introduced himself as the Executive Director for FEMAP - a private organization that works with public health and community development. FEMAP believes that the best resource of a community is the participation of its people. From this perspective his participation on the JAC will be the spokesman for the group he represents. Above all, with regard to the problems of the community and the alternatives to solve them which can be implemented to improve air quality and the quality of life in the region, he believes it is possible to move the forces of the community that can come to make the difference in this region. He is also aware that if we are unable to move the community forward the solutions to the problems will not be realized. Also, he is pleased to be on the committee and recognizes and appreciates the support from the federal government. This is the first binational committee working toward air quality improvement and a transcendental step forward. He is sure that the results achieved by the JAC will be highly stimulating and will further promote this type of institution. We are sure that the solutions to the problems are within us all.

Tom Martin: Introduced himself as the Environmental Manager for ASARCO in El Paso and Amarillo, TX. He has been doing environmental work for ASARCO for about 11 years and has been with the company for 27 years. He has also been with the PDNAQTF since its inception. He wants to use his training and experience in regulatory and legislative development and practical experience to find out what will work to solve some of our air pollution problems and look for ways to work through the red tape to get things done. Some of his issues he will bring to the table include his knowledge of Supplemental Environmental Projects (SEPs), emission trading, and will in general try to get the most bang for the buck to get things done. This is a unique opportunity and he looks forward to the challenge.

Rene Franco Ruiz: Introduced himself as the President of the Mexican Ecological Movement (MEM) in CD Juarez. He thanked those involved in the selection process for selecting MEM for participation on the JAC. He also recognized the PDNAQTF which was the initial force behind the creation of the JAC. This recognition is justified due to the long-term commitment the group has made attempting to improve air quality and having realized the goal of creating a JAC. He has live in Cd Juarez all his life and recognizes the problems in which we live. Its important that environmental groups not complain about problems without end, but provide solutions to those problems. We have provided a distinct twist within the MEM by providing solutions to problems without discrediting programs. The JAC is also a distinct group with respect to its membership and he will provide positive solutions to solve the air quality problems in this border region.

Oscar Ibañez: Ing. Ibañez began by covering several aspects of this organization. First coordination and cooperation within the JAC will exponentially augment the possibilities to solve any problem and in this case this is a good premonition and a hopeful sign for committee. He thanked the members of the JAC and is familiar with most of its members and the personal

efforts each member has made in support for improved air quality and to environmental improvement in general. As a technical person and as a public servant he recognizes the potential of such a committee and support it will gain. Above all he wanted to make this particular point; this is a cultural advance at the local level, a political and administrative advance which perhaps we cannot value with complete plentitude. This is a tremendous advance in our coexistence as a binational community. In time we will more fully realize the value of what we have proposed and what this committee signifies as a model for other aspects of our binational and local relations. The work he has seen to date on both sides of the border by community groups, universities, businesses, regional authorities, private organizations and unaffiliated individuals is valuable. We can be much more fruitful as a committee if we realize our obligations assuring that the committee is practical and efficient.

John Cordova: Identified himself as a representative for the City of El Paso Public Works Department. Air quality, like all the members on the JAC stated before him, is very important to him. He brings with him a working knowledge of municipal government and will use that knowledge for the benefit of this committee. He will bring ideas and solutions to the table for air quality improvement. It is important to concentrate on simple, doable improvements that the public can see. He thanked Ms. Saginaw and Dr. Paramo as well as all the committee members and those in attendance for supporting such a great effort.

Ms. Saginaw: After listening to all the committee members it seems we share a common vision. First and foremost we are all interested in acting quickly in identifying problems and putting together solutions and share a commitment to keep these meetings open to the public. We can coordinate these meetings so they can be planned in advance. Many people are watching the committee; we need to demonstrate that we can achieve our goals quickly. There are many good ideas members in the group have been working on for in a long time. We will move forward and get to the meat of the issue.

Regarding procedural issues, there has been discussion among some of the members to form a subcommittee to establish the procedures regarding operational matters of the JAC to make the most of time we have.

Carlos Rincon: In the workbook presented earlier there is a section regarding procedural issues to help the JAC to work in greater detail. Members of the EDF have also offered to develop the procedural agenda for the committee. Several members of the JAC representing both the US and Mexico stated in their opening comments that we as a JAC could agree to temporary procedures such as the statement made by Quim. Pilar Leal stated concerning public notice of the meetings. Perhaps if we agree to publish notice of future meetings in newspapers 30 days in advance that would be acceptable. This issue would be only temporary as this issue would be covered as procedural matters are developed.

The agenda should state a specific starting time. We can also rotate the location of meetings and provide a period for public participation. Providing an opportunity for public comment is the best asset we can offer as our commitment to the community. We would like to have a central known place for keeping the minutes of meetings and an opportunity to evaluate the minutes.

Jane Saginaw: The next meeting of the binational work group may be in early February. The JAC can meet prior to this meeting in CD Juarez.

Elaine Barron: With the continuing work of the task force we can expedite discussion and identify problems and procedures that can be undertaken to solve air quality problems. Both the JAC and task force can work well together and the task force can also serve as an arena for discussions.

Jane Saginaw: EPA staff will provide support for this endeavor. Jim Yarbrough was then introduced to provide some perspective on Paso del Norte Air Quality. He has worked with the PDNAQTF these last 3 years and is congratulated for his efforts.

Jim Yarbrough: Showed a LIDAR (Light Detection and Ranging) map which epitomizes the shared nature of our air quality problems. We are confronted with a challenge to address this shared nature of air pollution. Several mechanisms are currently in place to address binational air pollution:

The La Paz Air Work Group is charged with the following:

- Determine an annual work plan;
- Give support to resource requests for projects;
- Serve as an umbrella organization for geographic projects and the air subworkgroup; and
- It is the group to which the JAC will make its recommendations.

Annex V to La Paz was signed in 1989 and created an air pollution study area of the El Paso, CD Juarez, Sunland Park air shed. A description of EPA's participation with the PDNAQTF and SCERP was also provided. EPA and SEMARNAP have published many reports to the public which describe a variety of research activities that have taken place in the Paso del Norte Region. This information could provide a basis for discussion by the JAC, and is available from Jim.

We don't want a ready, fire, aim approach to solving the air pollution problems. We want a ready, aim, fire approach due to the cost involved in implementing the solutions. However, some of the short-term solutions to air quality improvements may be to increase traffic flow across the international bridges (working with the Border Crossing 2000 Task Force - Danny Vickers' group).

Victor Hugo Paramo: He has spent the last seven years working in cooperation with the US to identify border air quality problems. The PDNAQTF convinced Mexico to move forward with the establishment of the JAC. Very often one works with and knows about a problem, but we don't arrive at a solution to solve the problem. The virtue of this committee is that it is formed by local residents. Each member on the JAC has ideas to solve the air quality problem indicating that the work to come will be motivating.

Archie Clouse: One topic he would like to have discussed is establishment of a SIP (State Implementation Plan) for CD Juarez. A SIP is a tool to identify initiatives to improve air quality. Currently the TNRCC, CD Juarez Ecology Department and the El Paso City County Health and Environmental District (EPCCHED) are working in cooperation to establish a Pollution Standard Index for Juarez in the form of the Mexican IMECA (Indice Metropolitano de Calidad del Aire). We are working to establish reference points using the air quality monitoring stations in CD Juarez to provide the community of CD Juarez with air quality information. We are also moving forward to establish a binational, community-wide integrated air quality monitoring network to provide air quality information to the residents of this border community. Funds are currently available to obtain data from air quality monitoring stations in Mexico. Currently there is a slight difference between US and Mexican air quality standards, but as far as integrating the air monitoring stations it really does not matter what the standard is.

Oscar Ibañez: We currently do not have a method of stating the Pollution Standards Index in Juarez. It is possible we may have an unhealthful air quality situation in Juarez but may be unable to communicate that to the community without real-time information. He therefore identifies with INE's support to integrate the CAMS stations in CD Juarez with those in El Paso, TX, and Sunland Park, NM. He will further continue discussions with the TNRCC and EPCCHED to integrate the air quality index for the region. He provided three alternatives for providing a regional air quality index for the Paso del Norte region:

- Provide one regional PSI for the entire community - PSI for the US & IMECA for Mexico;
- Provide separate local air quality indexes based on monitoring stations in their respective countries - PSI in the US and IMECA in Juarez due to differences in standards.
- Maintain the PSI as currently stated in El Paso and translate it to the IMECA with a sub-index for each particular pollutant index identifying the location of the monitoring station where that particular index is was measured.

Victor Hugo Paramo: He has seen the proposal to establish an air quality index for Juarez and believes that it is important to begin talking about one level of identification of such an index. The IMECA structure is similar to the PSI. There are differences between the IMECA and the PSI which is derived from the National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS), but the

differences are small. The greater difference at this time involves the exchange of data from the monitoring stations.

Enrique Suarez: Its probably redundant emphasizing information sharing especially since information will be what we need to make recommendations. He urged we expedite the establishment of a method of providing the IMECA index for CD Juarez. Perhaps a regional PSI would work but in the short term we may be able to use US data to provide the IMECA.

Oscar Ibañez submitted a resolution to Integrate Information in the Continuous Ambient Monitoring Stations (CAMS) with the Objective to Generate Information for the Public regarding Air Quality Indexes and to Recommend Necessary Preventative Measures: (for the record the translation is literal).

Although there exist automatic air quality monitoring stations in the three cities which form the Paso del Norte international air basin, it seems only the three State of Texas air monitoring stations located in El Paso, TX and three stations for the City of El Paso are integrated to provide information through which a pollution standard index for El Paso, Texas is derived.

Currently, financial resources have been approved by INE-SEMARNAP to integrate air quality information from the three Juarez CAMS in order to obtain real-time data from those zones where the CAMS are located. The assigning of those financial resources is currently pending. One its behalf, EPA supports the City of El Paso with financial resources which facilitates this process in CD Juarez. We currently do not have information regarding the CAMS located in Doña Ana County, New Mexico.

Regarding an air quality reporting system, El Paso currently utilizes the PSI (Pollution Standard Index) and twice daily submits air quality information to the community. Only criteria pollutants are specified in the PSI: ozone, carbon monoxide and particulates. These compose the most significant pollutants for this region.

The JAC will work with Jesus Reynoso, Oscar Ibañez, Erik Aaboe and Archie Clouse to electronically integrate the communications between the CAMS in this region. This group shall determine which reporting system is most appropriate for the air basin.

We expect that both actions (to integrate the CAMS and specify the reporting system) shall be operational before year's end and we can count on the total support of all authorities involved in air quality issues in both countries.

Archie Clouse: Second's the motion.

Jane Saginaw: Asked the JAC if this recommendation to develop a pollution standard index for

CD Juarez was acceptable. This recommendation has much support from the committee. She asked if the committee could develop a list to prioritize further recommendations.

Danny Vickers: Initiatives of the JAC indicate a consensus to develop a PSI is in place, and this issue is resolutely endorsed by the task force. He also requested support for one of the PDNAQTF initiatives in which he is involved known as the Paso del Norte Border Crossing 2000 Task Force (BC2000). BC2000 is focused on more quickly moving vehicles across the international bridges and through customs inspection stations. Automobiles impact air quality, and increased wait times at the international bridges exacerbate the problem. The BC2000 task force is working w/ U.S. and Mexican federal agencies to initiate a dedicated commuter lane on the bridges and install technology in cars indicating to Customs agent that the vehicle and its passengers are identified, cross the border often, and do not pose a risk to the U.S.

Tom Martin: Emissions Reductions Credits (ERC) trading programs are currently in place to identify offsets and realize emissions reduction credits for US businesses. An international ERC program needs to be developed under the FCAA. The TNRCC needs to assure the credits earned by the installation of emission control equipment in Juarez are valid. Emissions reductions programs could involve particulate reductions achieved by road paving, buying older cars or installing control equipment in businesses.

Elaine Barron: Spoke w/ Lic. Leonora Rueda from the SRE (Secretaria de Relaciones Exteriores) regarding development of an international emissions trading program in this region. Both determined that Dr. Victor Hugo Paramo can guide us in the direction that Mexico wants us to take regarding this initiative.

Victor Hugo Paramo: Is in agreement with Elaine and Tom. He stated that legal issues need to be considered. Proposals need to be developed that go hand in hand with pollutants. With photochemical oxidants you have a difficult problems. To achieve these complex goals you need a complete emissions inventory to quantify source. Some of this information will be forthcoming with the results generated by the Summer ozone study that took place in the Paso del Norte region. He works with technical information on a regular basis and in order for this type of program to be fully understood he needs to spend time covering the technical information. He would like information such as enforceability of an international emissions credits trading program under the FCAA.

Jane Saginaw: Provided philosophical support for Dr. Paramo's concerns and an international emissions reduction credits trading program. As a lawyer its important to understand the procedural issues behind such an initiative.

Enrique Suarez: Many initiatives require support of rules and regulations. Rules regarding brick

makers require they use gas (LP or natural), but costs are too high and are not profitable to provide a livelihood of the brick maker. There are political, economic, and social implication behind all these rules and regulations coming from the federal, state and local level. Vehicles in the city are old. CD Juarez must make vehicular traffic movement more fluid and synchronize traffic lights. There exist a series of simple measures that may be undertaken where the impact is great. There are laws, rules, and regulations that consider point, mobile and area sources of air pollution that need to be followed. He would like a recommendation coming from the JAC regarding the brick making industry in Cd Juarez.

Gerardo Tarin: At PDNAQTF meetings we receive input from many people and discuss the impact of air pollution from all levels. We're in a bad time and need to work with the community to improve the situation.

Archie Clouse: All issues such as emissions inventories (E.I.), supplemental environmental projects (SEPs), laws, rules and regulations are based on the question, why?. What pollutants and how much comes from what sources. Developing an emissions inventory is the fundamental step in determining the source of air pollution in the Paso del Norte air basin. We need justification to earn emissions reduction credits. With an E.I. we can identify problem sources and suggest control strategies. Controls will reduce pollutants and the E.I. will identify not only the initial levels of pollutants coming from the source, but the amount of reduction realized once the controls are put in place. From this perspective emission reduction credits can be earned.

Enrique Suarez: An emissions inventory for this region is fundamental. The public needs information and we need to educate the public. FEMAP has an E.I. of the brick makers community that identifies particulates and sources. A few years ago FEMAP conducted a study which identified emissions and contaminants produced by various fuel sources.

Jane Saginaw: EPA currently has 17 reports of studies that took place in the Paso del Norte region. This information will be made available to the members of the JAC and the public in order to help formulate recommendations.

Jim Yarbrough: Recently TNRCC also completed a mobile source emissions study to update our information on these sources in the CD Juarez area. This study helped determine emissions factors to develop a mobile source E.I for CD Juarez and is known as the Mobile 5Juarez. Texas is updating industrial information for El Paso and local groups are involved in updating industrial information from CD Juarez. We almost have a complete package.

Jane Saginaw: At the next meeting we need more information to have as a baseline.

Charles Groat: This is true. The committee needs this type of background information to make

decisions and talk about making recommendations to the La Paz work group and perhaps other entities with a similar mission.

Rene Franco: This committee needs to identify short-term, mid-term and long term projects. Besides the E.I., the problem lies with mobile sources. We don't necessarily need an EI to determine that mobile sources are the greatest source of air pollution. The Committee should send a proposal to the State of Chihuahua to make vehicle inspections mandatory. An EI and monitoring network are all informational, but will not provide solutions as much as taking a proposal to the Congress of the State of Chihuahua. In considering the Pollution Standard Index who is to say what is healthful and unhealthful. Health problems such as asthma will occur, but what are the levels which have health consequences.

Pilar Leal: PROFEPA has proposed transit laws which require mandatory vehicle inspections, and it is important to move these proposals forward to the appropriate authorities.

Victor Hugo Paramo: Regarding the IMECA, Mexico has developed rules and regulations regarding the levels which are considered healthful and unhealthful. He also is familiar with the PSI, and the differences between the two system are not significant.

What followed was a short discussion on issues regarding a PSI and its implementation in this region. A recommendation was made to develop a PSI for Juarez to provide air quality information for the citizens of Juarez. Consensus was arrived at to provide a JAC recommendation to develop a PSI.

After a short break the JAC continued.

Jane Saginaw: This committee has provided six recommendations which were summarized:

- 1) Provide joint air quality information to the community;
- 2) Support the Paso del Norte Border 2000 Task Force mission to improve the flow of traffic across the international bridges and reduce wait time;
- 3) Establish an international emission credits trading program;
- 4) Establish a joint emissions inventory;
- 5) State the need for regulation and enforcement of brick makers standards and other sources of air pollution; and
- 6) Establish obligatory vehicle inspections in CD Juarez.

An over-riding comment has been the need for public information and public support in this entire process. A question was raised regarding the BC2000 and obligatory vehicle inspections what this group could do is write a letter in support of those two ongoing efforts.

Volunteers were requested; Danny Vickers, Oscar Ibañez and Rene Franco offered to work with Jim Yarbrough;

On a joint air quality index, work can be done in the short term to take some concrete recommendations to the binational air workgroup that meets early next year. Volunteers were sought to work with Jim Yarbrough. The following persons stepped up: Archie Clouse, Oscar Ibañez, and Carlos Rincon. Dr. Gilberto Melendez from the Secretariat of Health in Mexico suggested Dr. Rosalba Rojas from SSA be considered for this group. As a note Jesus Reynoso from EPCCHED and Victor Valenzuela from TNRCC are also currently working with the above mentioned volunteers to establishing the framework for this effort.

On an international emissions trading program (an easy one), Carlos Rincon identified several interested parties. Ron Ketter from UTEP, Chris Shaver from EDF, Tom Martin, Mark Rodriguez, El Paso Electric, and Mexican Officials whom we cannot committed to this effort but who were identified - Dr. Francisco Giner de los Rios from INE; PROFEPA was also requested to participate. We still need NGO, private and academic institutions, Carey Fitzmaurice from EPA, Enrique Suarez and Rene Franco Ruiz.

The brick makers standards. Carlos Rincon suggested FEMAP, the State of Chihuahua, Oscar Ibañez, and Dr. Octavio Chavez from PDNAQTF. Carlos Rincon also suggested several persons: Dr. Elaine Barron, Enrique Suarez, Ing. Daniel Chacon, Gerardo Tarin, and Victor Valenzuela.

Rene Franco asked if someone from the brickmaking community should also be considered for this group.

Carlos Rincon indicated FEMAP would be the spokesman for the brickmakers community.

Jane Saginaw indicated that regarding the vehicle inspection program the JAC would draft a letter. At the next meeting we'll be able to provide some background information on the new ozone and Particulate Matter standards of which the JAC needs to remain aware. The next meeting was set for February 18, 1997 which is shortly before the binational workgroup meets.

The floor was opened for public comment.

Beatriz Vera representing Physicians for Social Responsibility Border Environment and Health Project identified the importance of public participation. Currently, her work deals with the health effects of air pollution. In her previous work in water quality, there were various self help activities people could do to clean and protect their water short of major structural investments. For the past two years working in air pollution and respiratory health, there are very few things

individual persons can do to take charge of their respiratory health and air quality.

Her recommendation to the committee is that notice for upcoming meetings not only be published in the newspapers, which is insufficient considering circulation data for newspapers on both sides of the border, and expand to radio, e-mail and make use of public service announcements on both radio and TV. In Mexico there's a law allowing free time to run PSA's. We also need better use of community calendars. She also offered a mailing list with 2,000 names representing citizens groups, health care professionals and community organizations to whomever is going to be responsible for informing the public regarding the activities of the JAC. BECC and EPA have extensive mailing lists used for Border XXI and other meetings on both sides of the border and should be used to their fullest extent.

Dr. Octavio Chavez, Chairman of the PDNAQTF, requested that at upcoming meetings time should be made available for public comment prior to the JAC making recommendations to take into consideration the public point of view. At the next meeting he requested there be an agreement regarding Dr. Charles Groat's comment that the JAC not limit itself to working with the Air Workgroup and be an organization that promotes ideas with broader impact in other areas. This endeavor is already demonstrated by the two letters that will be submitted as part of this first meeting. There should be explicit consensus that this group will work not only with the Air Workgroup but expand its scope of organizations with which it will work.

Jesus Reynoso, representing EPCCHED, informed the JAC he has been in contact with a Mr. John MacDonald from the International Joint Commission established between the US and Canada regarding environmental matters. Mr. MacDonald indicated to Mr. Reynoso that the IJC is planning their upcoming quarterly meeting in El Paso, TX Feb. 3,4,5 and would like to meet with as many members of the JAC as possible and would like for the members of the JAC to attend their meeting. The IJC is very interested in what has been going on here between El Paso, Juarez, and Sunland Park wishes to come to the region to learn what can be done on the US / Canada border. Copies of information Mr. MacDonald sends will be provided to the JAC.

Dr. Elaine Barron provided a comment regarding JAC organizational procedures and policies Carlos Rincon will be developing. It is customary to state one's name in these public meetings so that each person is identified with whatever proposals and resolutions, thought processes they have for an official record that will be developed. She has had the privilege to be asked to serve as committee chairman for the TX Medical Assn. Environmental Committee (TMAEC). She hopes the work of the JAC and the TMAEC can be coordinated. With information and input from the JAC members she would like to expand the health concerns of not only El Paso and Juarez, but throughout the entire state along the TX / MX border. Dr. Barron solicited input regarding projects of concern that can be proposed to the committee which will meet in Feb. 1997.

Draft Minutes: November 12, 1996
Joint Advisory Committee on Air Quality Improvement
Paso del Norte Air Quality Management Basin
JAC-1196.wpd

Dr. Groat asked if the JAC had overlooked a recommendation regarding Emissions Inventories.

Jane Saginaw asked for volunteers to work on this task. Carlos Rincon recommended Dr. Victor Hugo Paramo and the technical center in CD Juarez (Tecnologico de Cd Juarez) which is tasked to train its students in developing emissions inventories.

Dr. Victor Hugo Paramo indicated the methods to obtain an EI is different between the US and Mexico. In the US the State is charged with developing an EI, in Mexico the Federal Government is charged with this responsibility. He suggested a group formed by these entities: SEMARNAP/INE, PROFEPA, and the Ecology Departments of the State of Chihuahua and CD Juarez compose the Mexican part of an EI committee.

Jane Saginaw: The TNRCC and EPA will provide the US support for this group.

Oscar Ibañez: Regarding EI's he would like to have educational institutions which are involved in environmental programs be considered for participation.

Charles Groat: Offered UTEP's participation in developing an EI.

Archie Clouse: TNRCC Region 6 has shown its support for a broad range of border air quality initiatives and activities by employing Victor Valenzuela who will provide technical as well as administrative assistance to the PDNAQTF and to the JAC. Victor's job is to assist in completing an EI for CD Juarez and providing technical assistance to the members of the JAC. He is not a personal secretary, but he will be a central person responsible for information dissemination and completing the minutes of the JAC meetings. Mr. Clouse also suggested that Mexico consider a counterpart to Victor to assist Mexico's JAC members and serve as a central person where minutes of meetings are maintained and information is disseminated.

The meetings was then adjourned.